



Evaluation of the Impact of Values on Performance of Telecommunication Industry in Kaduna, Nigeria

Dr. Ahmad Bawa Abdul-Qadir and Aminu Aliyu Abbas

Department of Business Administration, Kaduna State University, Kaduna
Corresponding Email: bawaalkali@yahoo.com

ABSTRACT

The study investigates the impact of values on performance of the telecommunication industry in Kaduna metropolis, Nigeria. The study uses a survey research design, which utilizes questionnaires as the main instrument for data collection. The population of study is 115 employees with a sample size of 107 of the selected telecommunication companies namely; MTN, GLO, 9MOBILE and AIRTEL. Regression analysis using statistical package for social science (SPSS) was employed to analyze the data and test the hypotheses. The findings reveal that achievement values have a positive, significant impact on operational performance. The study concludes that core company values have significantly impacted on the operational performance which is speed and flexibility of the selected telecommunication companies in Kaduna metropolis. The study recommends that the management of these telecommunication companies should provide proper communication of these values during induction and in-house training of new and existing employees and motivate them to be operationally efficient at work.

Keywords: Values, achievement, speed, flexibility and operational performance.

Introduction

Over the past two decades, Nigeria's telecommunication industry has experienced growth and development. The mobile data that was once too expensive to provide or consume has become common, giving rise to a rapid increase in the use of smart phones and also resulting to a rise in new generation economic sub-sectors like e-commerce and digital marketing on the media. These have all come together to foster a much more robust Nigeria economy, buoyed by cheaper, faster, easier communication and information dissemination. Plain old phones was its biggest revenue generator but due to network technology advancement that has now changed having new generation subsectors like e commerce and digital marketing on the media. It allows us to share our thoughts speak and do business with nearly anyone not withstanding where in the world they might be. Nowadays advancement in network technology didn't just happen. The industry has contributed to

the social economic and political environment in Nigeria. This could be seen in the areas of social interaction and communication, the opportunity of employment and payment of taxes, sponsorship programs, political campaigns and so on. Organizations that espouse particular values will say that those values are the bases of their vision and the telecommunications industry is not void of such claims.

The importance of values in business; either production or rendering of services cannot be ignored. This is due to the fact that values are ideals, norms or goals that are established and held on to by individuals and societies. This paper is focusing on values from the study of Schwartz (1992) and its proxy includes; Achievement values such as success, capability, ambition, influence, intelligence, and self-respect are seen as crucial to most telecommunication companies. It can also be the success of an organization through

demonstrating competence according to social standards or prevailing cultural standards and there by obtaining approval socially.

Conformity values which simply buttress on self-restraint in everyday interaction with others. This includes obedience, politeness, and self-discipline, honoring parents and elders, responsible and being loyal. It also entails subordination to one's teacher, boss, and parents and so on.

The concepts of achievement and conformity values have come a long way but research on their impact operational performance in the telecommunication industry in the Nigerian context is still rudimentary. It is on this premise that the study seeks to fill the literature and environmental gaps.

This paper is focusing on the evaluation of the impact of values which are achievement and conformity on operational performance (speed and flexibility) in the telecommunication industry which include MTN, GLO, 9MOBILE, AIRTEL telecommunication companies in Kaduna metropolis. The findings will serve as a reference for further research, add value to existing literature on values and assist new and old organizations with company values adoption.

The objectives of this study are:

To identify the impact of achievement values on operational performance.

To find the impact of conformity values on operational performance

The paper is organized as follows: in the next section, it reviewed some of the conceptual, empirical and theoretical literature concerning values. In section 3 explains the methodology. The fourth section presents the results and it concluded and recommended in the last section.

Literature Review

This section provides the highlights of studies in the field of values and gives an overview of concepts related to the studies, empirical reviews in Nigeria and outside Nigeria by other researchers and theories of relevance.

Values

Values have come a long way and it is the most distinctive property of an individual and any social institution. The concept of values has been in the

fields of psychology, philosophy, ethics, social sciences, business, health, environmental management and others. They have viewed and defined values with regards to individuals and also society.

Super (1980) defines a value as “an objective either a psychological state, a relationship or material condition, that one seeks to attain”. Hofstede (1984) defines value as a broad tendency to prefer certain state of affairs over others. “A more elaborate definition is given by Schwartz (1992) “who define values as desirable states, objects, goals, or behaviours, transcending specific situations and applied as normative standards to judge and to choose among alternative modes of behaviours”. In the opinion of Krueger (1996), values are a set of beliefs that influence the way people and groups behave; they are the “soul” of the organization; effective values are deep rooted; and core values help form a social psychology that can support or overcome individual psychology”. Values according to Business Dictionary (2016) is a coherent set of values adopted and or evolved by a person, organization, or society as a standard to guide its behavior in preferences in all situations. According to Haralambos (2000) “a value is a belief that something is good and desirable”. For Mukerjee (1949) a pioneer Indian sociologist who initiated the study of social values states that “values are socially approved desires and goals that are internalized through the process of conditioning learning or socialization and that become subjective preferences, standards and aspirations. A value is a shared idea about how something is ranked in terms of desirability, worth or goodness. Values can also be categories from the point of view of their hierarchal arrangement which includes intrinsic values: these are values that are related with goals of life. They are sometimes known as ultimate and transcendent values. They determine the schemata of human rights and duties of human virtues. In the hierarchy of values, they occupy the highest place and superior to all other values of life. Secondly, instrumental Values which are values that come after the intrinsic values in the scheme of gradation of values. These values are means to achieve goals (intrinsic values) of life. They are also known as incidental or proximate values. (Puja Mondal Society, 2015). Rokeach (1973) defines values “as an ending belief that a specific mode of conduct or end-state of existence is personally or socially

preferable to an opposite or converse mode of conduct or end-state of existence". Values can be classified into two broad categories: Firstly, individual values are values relate with the development of human personality or individual norms of recognition and protection of the human personality such as honesty, loyalty, veracity and honor. Secondly, collective values are values connected with the solidarity of the community or collective norms of equality, justice, solidarity and socialness are known as collective values.

Concept of Achievement.

Schwartz (2012) explains that achievement is a personal or organizational success through demonstrating competence according to social standards or approval.

Furthermore, De Cecco and Crawford (1977) state that achievements are the expectancy of finding some satisfaction in mastering, difficult and challenging performances. In addition to that, Yelon, Weener and Weinstein (1977) state that achievement is the successfulness of an individual. Travers (1970) defines achievement as the result of what an individual has learned from some experiences educationally while another source Smith and Hudgins (1964) expresses achievement to be to do one's best, to be successful, to accomplish tasks requiring skills and effort and recognized by the authority. Tinambunan (1988) defines achievement as the grasp of some body of knowledge or proficiency in particular skills.

Based on the definitions and opinions above the study now defines achievement as the result or success one gets or an organization gets in mastering difficult and challenging knowledge or goal.

Concept of Benevolence

Schwartz (2012) states that benevolence is simply enhancing and preserving the welfare of those with whom one is with frequent personal contact (in-group)

David (2001) states that Benevolence is a commitment to achieving the values gotten from life with other people in the society, by treating them as potential partners in trade, recognizing their humanity, self-reliance and individuality and also the harmony between our interest and theirs.

Benevolence is the extent or degree to which a trustee is believed to want to do good to a trustor. The trustee wants to help the trustor even though the trustee is not required to be helpful and there is no extrinsic reward for him. Benevolence is the perception of a positive orientation of a mentor (trustee) towards a protégé (trustor). Mayers, James and David (1995)

Benevolence is a sense of confidence that a person's well-being or something one care about will be protected by a trusted person or trusted group. One can count on the good will of the other to act in the best interest of one .Wayne and Megan (1999).

Based on the definitions above this research now defines benevolence as a caring act performed towards enhancing and preserving the welfare of those with who an individual is in personal contact with regularly.

Operation Performance

Business Dictionary (2016) defines operational performance as simply a firm's performance measured against standard or prescribed indicators of efficiency, effectiveness and environmental responsibility for instance waste reduction productivity, regulatory compliance and cycle time. Andy (2007) explains that operational performance is a firm's performance after being measured against the prescribed or required quality, speed, flexibility, dependability and cost. The research now defines operational performance as the performance of a firm measured against standard indicators of efficiency, effectiveness and environmental responsibility such as quality, waste reduction, speed, cost, regulatory compliance, flexibility and dependability. Billie (2017) explains that an operational performance objective includes; quality, speed, dependability, flexibility and costs.

Quality: Andy (2007) states that quality is more than just conformance to specification but how well a product or service performs its intended function, the product feature desirability and its reliability. Andy views quality in another sense means product durability, the ease with which the product is serviced and the extent to which the customers believe the service or product meet their needs.

Speed: this simply means the rate at which a company can generate sales quotas and how rapidly and often a company can deliver its services and products (Andy 2007). In addition, speed refers to

issues such as the time required to manufacture one or more products and the time a company requires to research and develop a new product or service.

Dependability: A company can measure dependability in terms of the products ability to function as designed, as expected and to perform or work consistently over a reasonable amount of time. Andy (2007) regards to a company's operation as dependable if the company produces and delivers products to its consumers and customers on time and according to agreed costs and prices.

Flexibility: operations are flexible if a company can configure the product lines to deal with various requirements of a product and if the operations can adjust to new requirements quality. Flexibility also requires a company to adapt its operations to meet new or changing production volumes and delivery schedules.

Cost: this objective means the variation in unit cost as a result of changes in the volume produced by a manufacturer and the variety of products produced. Most at times, the higher the variety of products produced, the lower the volume produced and the higher the cost per unit and vice versa. Most importantly the cost of each product will be different which will affect the prices of the product, profits and running cost.

Empirical Reviews

The research by Kamiab and Kupuusamy (2017) assessed the interaction between personal values; organizational citizenship behavior (OCB) and service quality of all branches of two commercial banks (May bank and CIMB) in Malaysia with a total number of 117 branches. The portrait value questionnaire (PVQ) was used to measure the values. The employee sample consisted of 351 (one manager or assistant manager and two non-managerial employees from each branch, the sample of customers was 585 clients from all 117 branches. Partial least squares (PLS) approach was utilized to estimate the structural equation models and to evaluate the causal relationship between variables. The findings showed that conservation values (conformity, security and tradition) had the highest impact on bank service quality while self-transcendence value (Benevolence and Universalism) did not have any relationship with service quality with mediation role of OCB same as

the result in direct effect. Openness to change and self-enhancement values had an effect on service quality but not considerable. They recommended that conservation values of employees should be paid more attention.

In Matilde and Loyola (2015) research on values was conducted to determine the effect of values on the performance in biology of college students in Philippines. A pretest – posttest control group design was used with a researcher made questionnaire employed for values and performance. Cooperative learning was employed as a teaching technique for experimental group while it was a traditional lecture – discussion method for the control group. Findings showed that there was a variation in ranking both groups showing same response in terms of values during their pretest. But on the performance level a very satisfactory result came from the experimental group in contrasts to the control group that needed improvements, showing its effect on performance while the personal characteristic, occupation of mother and estimated monthly family income were significant predictors of values. Matilde (2015) concluded that cooperative learning produces positive results on performance satisfactorily and recommended that longer time frame and larger samples should be used to replicate the effect of student values and performance and teachers should adopt the technique to improve students values on how they should function as a group to make their relationship with one another better while working on an assigned task for the most part. The academic research by Matilde (2015) was well conducted using pretest and posttests but the sampling method and sample size used were not clearly stated. This academic work was on the effect of values on performance in biology college of students in Philippines values such as leadership, diligence, resourcefulness, sharing and cooperation and the performance of students were determined in Philippines while the present study is on the impact values (Achievement and conformity) on operation performance in the telecommunication industry Kaduna metropolis, Nigeria.

In Gonzalez, Diaz-Fernandez and Simonetti (2014) research study which aimed to explore whether Schwartz's value theory was applicable to the social science students who were Spanish at the undergraduate level and also to bring new

knowledge to the relationship between basic values and those patterns which determine perception under social initiative carried out by a company. A self-completion structured questionnaire was used to collect quantitative data from 1060 university students. Regression analysis and correlation was used for the study. The analysis revealed that the best predictors for acceptance were Benevolence, Universalism, Security, Conformity and gender and they positively influence the acceptance of social initiative developed by the company and also women like the social initiative more than men. Self-direction, stimulation, security, and tradition values were positively correlated to the support dimension. Universalism, Achievement, Security, and Conformity influenced the perceived usefulness dimension positively. Gonzalez, Diaz-Fernandez and Simonetti (2014) did recommend that individuals should be educated using CSR/Business ethics programs to provide better understanding of the concept but also cultivating on them the awareness of being responsible with the environment and society. By and large, Gonzalez, Diaz-Fernandez and Simonetti (2014) was logical and organized, it did look at modern theory of Schwartz and also dimensions of social initiative but the introductory part of the research could have expressed the researchers ideas in words rather than have too many citations, a regression analysis was conducted but there was no model to show how the variables correlate. The research is on values and corporate social initiative not on values and operational performance in the telecommunication industry Kaduna metropolis, Nigeria.

In Cirnu and Bostjan (2013) research on values examined the impact of employees' personal values on their attitude toward economic, environmental and social aspect of sustainable development. An online survey was conducted among employees in Slovenian and Romanian organizations. The study received 115 Slovenian and 86 Romanian responses from the online survey. Schwartz value survey questionnaire was used to measure personal values. The data was examined with regression analysis. The findings showed that for the Slovenian sample power, stimulation and self-direction values were significantly related to the employees' attitudes towards economic aspect while benevolence values were significantly related to the environmental aspect. For the

Romanian sample, achievement values were significantly related to employee's attitude towards economic aspect; benevolence, conformity and stimulation were significantly related to environmental aspect while benevolence and stimulation values were significantly related to societal concern. Cirnu and Bostjan (2013) recommended that there is need to conduct further research on the association to the different sustainability measures and indexes. Policy makers should clarify sustainability level to employees, and also management should take into consideration these measures when doing business outside his/her cultural settings.

The research is on impact personal values (10 of Schwartz) on employees' attitude towards sustainable development and not on value system and operational performance in Kaduna, Nigeria. Cirnu and Bostjan (2013) was well organized and it did provide a detailed sample characteristics but it could have explained the method of sampling for the better understanding of an average reader.

The impact of value orientation on socio psychological capital was analyzed by Tatarko (2013). Three ethnic groups were used as sample which included the Russians $n = 103$, Chechen $n = 100$ and the Ingush $n = 109$. These groups are representatives of the North Caucasus federal district of Russia. A simultaneous confirmatory factor analysis was carried out and the results showed that the study lacked measurement in variance for the three ethnic groups therefore modeling analyses were conducted separately for each ethnic group. Some variables were evaluated through questions from the (WVS) World Value Survey. Findings show that self-transcendence values have positive impact on socio psychological capital and self enhancement values have negative impact. Openness to change values positively influences civic identity but negatively affect perceived social capital. Conservation values also demonstrated a positive relationship with civic identity, however in this study; this effect was manifested only in the Ingush sample. In conclusion, the influence of values orientations on socio psychological capital is not decisive but essential. For the most part, Tatarko (2013) was well conducted and detailed but failed to clearly state the recommendations of the study. The research is on

orientation of value and socio-psychological capital while the present study is on the impacts of some of those values on performance operationally in the telecommunication industry.

A study was conducted using the horizontal and vertical distinction within individualism and collectivism to predict diff in achievement values across two national cultures Denmark and United States by Micheller and Sharon (2002). Sample respondents from Denmark (Danish n = 82 communication students) while from United States respondents n = 152 communication students. The study investigated the values of the two nations using semi structured interviews and also to examine the cultural orientations. The data was analyzed using 2 x 2 ANOVAs. A multi variant analysis of variance (MANOVA) was conducted with culture and gender as the independent variables and the four cultural orientation scales as dependent variables. It was found that the United States was more vertically oriented than the Denmark and Denmark more horizontally oriented than the United States. Findings further showed that the cultural orientations relate to achievement values in very similar ways in the United States and Denmark with achievement linking to VI in these individualist cultures. Micheller and Sharon (2002) recommended that further research should be conducted in the areas using larger sampling. For the most part, Micheller and Sharon (2002) was well researched but its sampling method was not explained, theories in the study should have been in detail and the study is on achievement values and horizontal and vertical individualism in US and Denmark while the present study is to find the impact of values which is achievement values on operational performance in the telecommunication industry Kaduna, Nigeria.

The value theory Schwartz(2006) adopts a conception of values that specifies six main features that are implicit in the writings of many theorists: values are beliefs linked inextricable to affect. Values refer to desirable goals that motivate action. Values transcend specific actions and situations. Values serve as standard or criteria. Values are ordered by importance relative to one another. Values that are multiple guide action. The value theory defines ten broad values according to the motivation that is expresses or underlies each of them and it has been empirically validated in at least 65 countries.

Schwartz theory of Basic value

Self-direction: Defining goal: independent thought and action choosing, creating and exploring. Self-direction derives from organic needs for control and mastery (Bandura, 1977; Deci 1975) and independent requirements of autonomy and independence (Kluckhohn, 1951; Kohn and Schooler 1983) **Simulation:** Defining goal; excitement, novelty, and challenge in life. Simulation values derives from organic need for variety and stimulation in order to maintain an optimal, positive, rather than threatening, level of activation (Berlyne, 1960).

Hedonism: Defining goal: pleasure or sensuous gratification theorists from many disciplines (Freud, 1933) mention hedonism.

Achievement: Defining goal: personal success through demonstrating competence according to social standards. Competent performance that generates resources is necessary for individuals to survive and for groups and institution to reach their objectives.

Power: Defining goal: Social status and prestige, control or dominance over people and resources value analysts have mentioned power values as well (Allport, 1961).

Security: Defining goal: safety, harmony and stability of society of relationships and of self. Some security values serve primarily individual interests (for instance; clean) other wider groups interest (for example; National security).

Conformity: Defining goal: restraint of actions; inclinations, and impulses likely to upset or harm other and violet social expectations or norms. (obedience, self-discipline, politeness, honouring parents and elders) (loyal and responsible).

Tradition: Defining goal: respect, commitment, and acceptance of the customs and ideas that one's culture or religion provides.

Benevolence: Defining goal: preserving and enhancing the welfare of those with whom one is in frequent personal contact (the in-group). (helpful, honest, forgiving; responsible, loyal, true friendship, mature love).

Universalism: Defining goal: understanding, appreciation, tolerance, and protection for the welfare of all people and for nature. According to this theory, all these values are very important in both individuals and work place settings and that is a major reason for the study to be hinged on this theory.

Methodology

In an attempt to empirically examine the impact of value systems on performance, the study uses primary data using a survey research design. The data was collected using questionnaires. The instrument of data collection used is the modified version of Schwartz value survey questionnaire (SVS) Schwartz (1996) for values while Doglin (2009) questionnaire was used to develop questions for speed and flexibility.

The total population of the study is 115 members of staff of the telecommunication companies. 30 staff from 9MOBILE, MTN 25, GLO 40, and Airtel 20. The Krejcie and Morgan (1970) sample determination table was used to arrive at a sample size of 107 staff members; having 28 for 9MOBILE, 24 MTN, 36 for GLO and 19 for AIRTEL.

Model Specification

In functional form it's represented as follows; $OPP = f(V)$
 Operational performance is a function of values
 In equation form its represented as follows:
 $OPP = + B_1 ACH + B_2 CON + E_i$
 Where;
 V = values
 OPM = Operational Performance
 ACH= achievement value BEN= benevolence values
 E_i = Standard Error of Estimate
 = Constant or Intercept
 $B_1 - B_3$ = Coefficient of Independent Variable

Variable Measurement

Performance Measurement.

In the study, the Dependent Variable performance is measured as:

Operational Performance = speed and flexibility. Andy (2007)

Table 1 Explanatory Variable Measurement

The proxies for values are achievement and conformity which were measured using capability and success, obedience and polite as seen on the table above respectively.

Variable	Proxy	Measurement
Values	Achievement	Success and capability
Values	Conformity	Obedience and polite

Results Discussion and Presentation

In this section, the regression results of the models of the study are presented and interpreted. The hypotheses formulated for the study are also tested from the results as presented in Table 2 below;

Table 2 Summary of Regression Result

Variables	Co-efficient	t-statistics	p-values
Constant	0.200	0.311	0.756
ACH	0.344	2.050	0.043
CON	0.233	1.002	0.319
R	0.498		
R ²	0.248		
ADJ R ²	0.217		
F-Stat	8.145		
F-Sig	0.000		
DW	1.497		

Source: SPSS 22 (Appendix ii)

The Table 2 present the regression results of OLS model.

This section presents, interprets and discusses the regression result of the dependent variable (Operational performance) and the independent variables of the study (achievement values). The presentation of the result takes the form of analyzing the relationship between the dependent variable and each independent variable as well as the analysis of the combined result of the model.

Achievement and Operational performance

Hypothesis: Achievement does not have a significant impact on operational performance in the telecommunication industry. Achievement is found to have positively and significantly impacted on the Operational performance of telecommunication industry at five percent level of significance. From table 2 it is clearly seen that the t-value for Achievement (ACH) is 2.050 and a coefficient value of 0.344 with a significant value of 0.043 (at 5% significance level). This signifies that achievement is positively and significantly impacting on the Operational performance of telecommunication industry in Kaduna, Nigeria. Therefore, achievement values can improve

Operational performance. This is in line with both priori expectation and reality as achievement in life makes a person contributes to the operational performance of his organization. With this, the null hypothesis is therefore rejected and the alternate hypothesis is accepted.

Conformity and Operational performance.

Hypothesis: Conformity does not have a significant impact on operational performance of telecommunication industry in Kaduna, Nigeria. The study reveals positive and insignificant impact of Conformity on the operational performance of telecommunication industry in Nigeria at thirty-two percent. The Conformity has a t-value of 1.002, coefficient value of 0.233 and p-value of 0.319. This indicates that Conformity has positive and insignificant impact on the operational performance of telecommunication industry in Nigeria. This is also in line with the researcher's priori expectation and what is obtainable in reality.

Conclusion and Recommendations

For the most part, the study concludes that value system has significantly impacted on the operational performance of telecommunication companies in Kaduna, Nigeria. Therefore the responsibility for ensuring the value system is vested with the management of the telecommunication companies. Thus the management should ensure as much as possible that: They provide proper communication of these values during induction and in-house training of new and existing employee to enable them know and use these values appropriately at work.

Efficient and effective security should be adopted by the management to ensure that the employees feel very safe and secure at their work place in order to ensure operational efficiency. Since telecommunication companies are less efficient when there is a security breach. The telecommunication companies should maintain a consistent level of monitoring through monthly performance reviews of the employees, in order to make them more operationally efficient.

Further research should be conducted in this area of study by scholars and researchers to add value to literatures on values. Other areas such as tradition, simulation, power and so of Schwartz's study of values and other independent variable proxies

which include; cost, dependability and quality of operational performance.

Reference

- Allport, G.W. (1961). *Pattern and growth in personality* New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston.
- Andy, N. (2007). *Business performance measurement : Unifying theories and integrating practice* second edition Cranfield University, UK Cambridge University Press.
- Berlyne, D.E. (1960). *Conflict aroused and curiosity*. New York @ McGraw – Hill.
- Billie, N.(2017). *Operational Performance*. Retrieved from www.smallbusiness.chron.com/objectives-of-operational-performance-77937.html accessed 18 Jan. 2017.
- Business Dictionary (2016). *Operational Performance*. Retrieved from www.businessdictionary.com/definition/operational-performance.html accessed 27 July, 2017.
- Cirnu, C.E., & Bostjan, K. (2013). The impact of Employees' personal values on their attitude towards sustainable development case of Slovenia and Romania: *Management journal* vol, 18, pp 1 – 20.
- Clawson, C.J., & Donald, E. V. (1978). *Human values: A Historical and interdisciplinary Analysis*. North American – Advances in Consumer Research 5, 396 – 402
- David, K. (2001). *Benevolence*. Retrieved [www.importanceofphilosophy.com/ethnics – Benevolence.html](http://www.importanceofphilosophy.com/ethnics-Benevolence.html). Accessed 20th February, 2017.
- De Cecco, J.P., & Crawford, W. R. (1974). *The psychology of learning and instruction educational psychology*. New jersey: Prentice – Hall, inc., Englewood cliffs.
- Deci, E.L (1975). *Intrinsic motivation*: New York: Plenum.
- Doglin, W (2009). *Measuring Performance in Small and Medium Enterprises in the information and communication technology industries*. Doctorate Thesis RMIT University, Australia.
- Freud, S. (1933). *New introductory lectures in psychoanalysis*. Network : Norton.
- Gongalez, R. M.^a R., Diaz-Fernandez, M. C., & simonetti, B. (2014). Values and corporate social initiative: An approach through Schwartz

- theory. *International journal of Business and Society*.15 1.– 48.
- Haralambos, M. (2000). *Values Retrieved from www.yourarticlelibrary.com/society/values/its-meaning-characterize-types-importance/35072*. Accessed 20, June, 2016.
- Hofstede, G. (1984). The cultural relativity of the quality of life concept. *Academy of management Review* p. 389 – 39.
- Kluckhohn, C. (1951). *Values and value orientation in the theory of action: An exploration in definition and classification*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Kohn, M. L., & Schooler, C. (1983). *Work and personality*. Norwood NJ: Ablex.
- Krejcie, R. V., & Morgan, D. W. (1970) sample size determination table. Retrieved from Accessed 3 March, 2017.
- Krueger, C. (1996). *Element of high performing people process type cultures*. (on-line), available <http://ppc.ustont.edn/highperforming.html> accessed 29 Jan, 2017.
- Kumaib, Z., & Kuppusamy, S. (2017). Personal values, OCB and Bank Service Quality. *International Business management. Medwell Journals*.11 (1) 281 – 2929.
- Matilde, C. C., & Loyola, A. (2015). Effects of values on the performance in Biology college students. *Asian journal of educational research*. Vol 3 No. 3.
- Mayers, R. C., James, H. D. F., & David, S. (2015). Benevolence. *The Academy of management review* Vol. 20 No. 3 Academy of management publishers pp. 709 – 734.
- Micheller, R. N., & Sharon, S. (2002). Horizontal and vertical individualism and Achievement values. A multi method Examination of Denmark and the United States. *Journal of cross-cultural psychology*. Vo 33 No. 5 pp 439 – 458.
- Mukerjee, R. K. (1949). *Meaning of values*. Retrieved from www.yourarticlelibrary.com/society/values/its-meaning-characterize-types-importance/35072. Accessed July 4, 2016.
- Puja Mondal Society (2016). *Value: Its meaning, characteristics types and importance* retrieved from www.yourarticlelibrary.com/values-meaning-characteristic-types-importance/35072/ Accessed July 2, 2016.
- Rokeach, M. (1973). *The nature of human values*. New York – free press. 438 pp.
- Schwartz, S.H. (2012). An Overview of Schwartz's Theory of Basic Values. Online readings in psychology and culture, 2 (1). <http://dx.doi.org/10.9707/2307-0919.1116>
- Schwartz, S.H. (1996). Are there universal aspect in the context and structure of values? *Journal of social issues* p 50, 19 – 45.
- Schwartz, S.H. (1992). *Universals in the Content and Structure of values*. Theoretical advances and empirical test in 20 countries. In M.Zanna (Ed) *Advances in experimental social psychology*. New York Academic Press (pp. 1 – 65).
- Smith, L. M., & Hudgins, B. B. (1964). *Educational psychology*. An Application of Social and Behavioural Theory. New York: Alfred A. Knopf.
- Super, D.E. (1980). A life span approach to career development. *Journal of occupational psychology*. P 52 – 129 – 148..
- Tatarko, A. (2013). Are individual value Orientations related to socio-psychological capital? *A Comparative Analysis Data from three ethnic groups in Russia*. National Research University. Wp 5/04 search working paper.
- Tinambunan, W. (1988). *Evaluation of student Achievement*. Jakarta: Depdikbud.
- Travers, J.P. (1970). *Fundamentals of Educational psychology*, Scrantom, pensylvania: International textbook company.
- W a y n e , K . H . , & M e g a n , T . M . (1999). Benevolence. *Journal of school leadership volume 9* Technomic publishing co.inc. 1052 – 6846/99/03 0184 – 25.
- Yelon, S. L., Weinstein, G. W., & Weener, P. D. (1977). *Teachers World*. Psychology in the classroom. Tokyo: MC Graw-Hill, inc

